

**UK TRANSPLANT
SPECIAL HEALTH AUTHORITY**

**MINUTES OF THE THIRTY-SECOND MEETING
OF THE SPECIAL HEALTH AUTHORITY
HELD AT 11.00 AM ON TUESDAY, 1 JUNE 2004
IN CONFERENCE SUITE 2, UKT, BRISTOL**

- PRESENT:**
- | | | |
|----------------------|---|--|
| Gwynneth Flower | - | Chairman |
| Margaret Branthwaite | - | Non-Executive Director |
| Dave Collett | - | Director of Statistics and Audit |
| Martin Davis | - | Director of Finance |
| Sue Falvey | - | Director of Donor Care & Co-ordination |
| Penny Hallett | - | Director of Communication & PR |
| George Jenkins | - | Non-Executive Director |
| Judith Mackay | - | Non-Executive Director |
| Alistair McGilchrist | - | Non-Executive Director |
| Gilbert Park | - | Non-Executive Director |
| Gurch Randhawa | - | Non-Executive Director |
| Chris Rudge | - | Medical Director |
| David Shute | - | Director of IT and Support Services |
| Sue Sutherland | - | Chief Executive |
- IN ATTENDANCE:** Kathy Cardwell - Secretary

APOLOGIES

Apologies were received from Neil Goodwin.

1 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST IN RELATION TO THE AGENDA

- 1.1 The Medical Director advised that he was in receipt of sponsorship from a pharmaceutical company to attend a meeting in the USA, although this did not cause a conflict of interest with any items in relation to the agenda.

**2 MINUTES OF THE 31ST MEETING OF THE SHA HELD ON
23 APRIL 2004 - UKT(M)(04)3**

- 2.1 The Minutes of the meeting were agreed and signed as a true and correct record.
- 2.2 **Action Points – UKT(AP)(04)4**
- 1 A proposal to discuss uniform criteria for patients requiring an ocular transplant was to be submitted to OTAG in June.
 - 2 The Medical Director confirmed that the position statement on living donor liver transplantation had been submitted to NSCAG and NSD.
 - 3 The necessary amendment had been made and the clinical governance strategy would now be distributed.
 - 4 A date had now been set for discussions with ICNARC re liaison on the potential donor audit in the long term. This would be reported on at a future meeting.

- 5 A reply was awaited re a pilot to enclose organ donation information with hospital appointment information. The Director of Communications is monitoring the situation and will report back to the next meeting.
- 6 The Director of I, T & SS reported that a full CASU report and risk register will be reported at the next Audit Committee.
- 7 The full risk register is included at item 7 for information.
- 8 See minute 6.2.3.

2.3 **Matters arising, not previously identified**

Alistair McGilchrist reported that the paper on living liver donation had been favourably received by the National Services Advisory Group in Scotland.

3 **FINANCE AND BUSINESS PLANNING**

3.1 **Financial Report to 31 March 2004 – UKT(04)40**

- 3.1.1 Following the presentation of the provisional report to the last meeting the Director of Finance reported on the final position as at 31 March 2004. The requirement to remain within the allocated Revenue and Capital Resource Limits had been met with the Authority reporting an underspend position against the Revenue Resource Limit of £124k (including capital charges) and underspend against the Capital Resource Limit of £1k (subject to audit). The accounts would be submitted to the Audit Committee on 5 July 2004.

3.2 **Financial Report to 30 April 2004 – UKT(04)41**

- 3.2.1 The Department of Health had recently notified UKT of the funding level for 2004/05 with the business case initiative being fully funded. However, a non-recurring reduction of £638k had been made to the revenue budget for 2004/05. Strong remonstrations had been made to the Department and it was agreed to manage the reduction this year on the understanding that the funding would be reinstated next year. Members approved the revised budget figure of £13.202m and thanked the Director of Finance and his team for keeping the momentum going, notwithstanding the problems experienced over the past year. The Director of Finance stressed the importance of the latest Department of Health funding review recognising the funding levels required for 2005/06 and providing adequate funding levels thereafter.

3.3 **Activity Report – April 2004 – UKT(04)42**

- 3.3.1 The Board noted the number of transplants undertaken in the financial year to end of April 2004 compared to those in the previous year; and the performance against the Business Plan. Activity rates are much better than this time last year, although it is too early in the year to predict the long-term pattern. At this stage it appears that the initiatives now in place appear to be taking effect. In response to a comment from a Non-Executive Director, the Medical Director agreed to follow up on comments from Moorfields eye hospital that there is a lack of corneas for transplantation, as this is incorrect.

4 **PAPERS FOR APPROVAL**

4.1 **Draft annual report 2003/04 – UKT(04)43**

- 4.1.1 The Director of Communications reported on the features and design layouts for the draft annual report for 2003/04. The decision to feature a living transplant

storyline was discussed. Some members felt that the link between this storyline and the role of UK Transplant in increasing the availability of organs for transplant needed to be strengthened. A comment was made on the ambiguity of the figures used to show transplant activity and this was noted, together with other minor amendments.

5 PAPERS FOR INFORMATION

5.1 **Quarterly performance monitoring report: January to March 2004 – UKT(04)44**

5.1.1 A review of the Authority's organisational objectives and performance indicators took place on 14 April 2004. The majority of objectives had been achieved resulting in increased numbers of donors, transplants and registrants on the organ donor register. The Chief Executive noted a request for a summary of the authority's performance to the business plan with particular emphasis on the importance of the role of UKT within the wider NHS.

5.2 **The use of livers from non-heartbeating donors – UKT(04)45**

5.2.1 The Medical Director referred to guidance from the Department of Health on the offering of organs removed from cadaveric donors in the UK. These organs must first be offered to Group 1 (NHS entitled) patients but if no suitable recipients are available at any UK designated transplant centre then the organ may be used for a Group 2 (non-NHS entitled) patient. Concern had been expressed recently that livers retrieved from non-heartbeating donors at two liver units, as part of programmes funded in part by UK Transplant, were being transplanted predominantly into Group 2 patients. Further analysis of the data had led to the validity of this process being questioned and the matter was raised for discussion at the Liver Advisory Group. The Medical Directors of the two Trusts involved had been written to; one unit had agreed not to transplant Group 2 patients with non-heartbeating livers and to set up a protocol to discuss the offering with Group 1 patients. A response was, as yet, awaited from the second unit. In addition, UK Transplant had formally notified the Deputy Chief Medical Officer and the National Specialist Commission Advisory Group of the situation.

Members expressed grave concern at the implications of this practice on transplantation and on these particular units. It was felt that all the necessary steps had been taken at this time and the Medical Director agreed to provide a full report to the Audit Committee in July.

5.3 **Arms length body review – UKT(04)46**

5.3.1 This item was discussed in closed session.

5.4 **Controls assurance report – UKT(04)47**

5.4.1 The Director of I, T & SS reported that each year the Authority is required to carry out a self-assessment against a possible 21 controls assurance standards devised by the Department of Health. These include three core standards covering finance, risk management and governance as well as a new standard for 2003/04 covering research governance. Internal Audit was content with the Authority's self-assessed scores and would report on the standards and present their statements on work done on controls assurance to the next Audit Committee. It was agreed that the report to the Audit Committee should include detail on the reasons for the

shortfalls indicated in each category. Members noted the process and that a return had been made to the Department of Health by the deadline of 14 May 2004.

6 EXECUTIVE DIRECTORS' REPORTS

6.1 Medical Director's Report – UKT(04)48

6.1.1 The Department of Health working group on non-heartbeating donation took place on 13 May and was attended by the Chief Executive and Medical Director on behalf of UK Transplant. The group was set up to provide advice on the ethical, legal and philosophical perspectives on non-heartbeating donation, especially as this relates to consent and the establishment of death. This meeting concentrated on progress being made by working parties from the Intensive Care Society, by the British Transplantation Society, and by the Academy of the Royal Medical Colleges.

6.2 Chief Executive's report – UKT(04)49

- 6.2.1 The minutes of the Department of Health Accountability Review were circulated and Members noted that officials were satisfied with the performance of UK Transplant.
- 6.2.2 Directors of UK Transplant had agreed to a request from Southampton University and the British Organ Donor Society for financial support for a new research project aimed at identifying, amongst other things, the factors that prompted families to decline organ donation. The research will commence in September 2004 and will cost £96k spread across two years. Members commented that it would be more appropriate to contact families prospectively and not retrospectively in order to avoid causing further distress after the event.
- 6.2.3 A review of the Channel 4 programme on "The Transplant Trade" had been undertaken. Following the review it had been concluded that there was no evidence on which to base a complaint.
- 6.2.4 Members noted that in the Summer of 2004 the Department of Health would be launching a national NHS Direct Digital TV service to provide health information to the public. The service will include information on a variety of issues and will offer opportunities for UKT to raise awareness about the importance of organ donation and transplantation.

6.3 Director of Statistics & Audit's Report – UKT(04)50

- 6.3.1 The 7th Annual Congress of the British Transplantation Society was held in April with contributions from the UK Transplant Statistics and Audit Directorate. Members noted that the work of UK Transplant was also acknowledged in many other presentations.
- 6.3.2 The Director of Statistics and Audit also reported on presentations given at other conferences over the past year including the 24th Annual Meeting of the International Society for Heart and Lung Transplantation, held in San Francisco; and the Annual Meeting of the Association of Surgeons of Great Britain and Ireland, held in Harrogate. Future events include presentations at the Conference of the International Liver Transplant Society in Japan; and at the Conference of the Royal Statistical Society.
- 6.3.3 UK Transplant is now a member of the Pan-Government Agreement that enables the Authority to have access to Ordnance Survey geographical information products. This software will allow UK Transplant to map the location of donors, recipients, patients registered on the transplant list and ODR registrants. Other

applications are also feasible and a technical specialist from Ordnance Survey will be meeting with colleagues in the Statistics and Audit Directorate to initiate use of this product.

6.4 Director of Communication's Report – UKT(04)51

6.4.1 Members noted that UK Transplant has been granted licence to use the intellectual property rights (designs, logos, etc.) associated with the organ donation campaign work.

6.4.2 The Director of Communications updated the meeting on the activities of the South Asian organ donation campaign, which had changed emphasis in 2002/03 to motivate and provide opportunities for Asians to join the NHS Organ Donor Register. One of the most effective activities has been a presence at Asian melas and festival events and a contract has been awarded to TMP worldwide to provide and staff information stands at these events. In addition, UK Transplant is currently working with the Council of Ethnic Minority Voluntary Organisations on a joint campaign strategy to increase the number of organ donors from black and ethnic minority communities.

7 FOR INFORMATION ONLY:

7.1 Risk action plan and risk register as at 31 March 2004 – UKT(04)52

7.1.1 A copy of the risk action plan and risk register as at 31 March 2004 was noted for information.

8 ANY OTHER BUSINESS

8.1 Margaret Branthwaite reported on an initiative by the Royal Society of Medicine, which was conducting symposia on customers' perception on health choice. Those that had already been held had been very successful and further events were scheduled.

9 DATE OF NEXT MEETING

9.1 The next meeting of the SHA will be held at 12 noon on Monday 5 July 2004 in Conference Suite 2, UKT, Bristol.